

A Letter to the California Air Resources Board Regarding the Tropical Forest Standard

November 13, 2018

California Air Resources Board
1001 I Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

Dear CARB members and staff,

We are scientists—ecologists, economists, anthropologists, geographers, and climatologists. We are all directly involved with research to better understand climate change and to identify the best ways to avoid its most dangerous impacts. Many of us have spent decades working in the Tropics.

We are writing to strongly urge the California Air Resources Board to endorse the California Tropical Forest Standard (CTFS). We believe that California has a unique opportunity to leverage its global leadership on climate policy to advance a broad and inclusive agenda to address climate change by protecting tropical forests at scale.

The message we convey is this: slowing the loss and speeding the recovery of tropical forests is a critical part of any successful global strategy for minimizing the negative impacts of climate change. The CTFS is an important step towards unlocking this potential.

1. The best science shows us that tropical forests could help avoid the most dangerous impacts of climate change.¹⁻³

These carbon- and species-rich ecosystems could deliver 25 to 30% of the carbon emissions reductions needed by 2030 to avoid dangerous climate change.³ Slowing the deforestation and degradation of tropical forests, the source of as much as one fifth of global emissions,⁴⁻¹⁴ while allowing damaged forests to recover¹⁵⁻²⁰ is one of the most cost-effective, near-term steps towards a zero net carbon budget globally.²¹⁻²⁵

2. The CTFS could help unlock this potential.

The CTFS would establish a very high bar of methodological rigor, transparency and accountability for tropical forest jurisdictions—states, provinces, counties and even nations—that are taking steps towards low-emission development. Given California’s global leadership on climate change solutions and the depth of the analyses and public consultation that went into developing the Standard, we believe that the CTFS would be adopted by other programs under development by governments and industries to support the transition of tropical forest jurisdictions to equitable low-emission development. The Standard is also likely to be used by tropical forest jurisdictions themselves.

3. The importance of the CTFS goes beyond offsets and REDD+

The CTFS was deliberately developed as an alternative to project-based REDD+ and it reflects a recognition that one of the most promising pathways to achieve emissions reductions at scale in tropical forest regions is to encourage the governments of jurisdictions to partner with civil society, the private sector, and indigenous peoples and local communities to develop durable programs for low emissions development. While the standard could eventually inform efforts to recognize the emissions reductions achieved by tropical forest jurisdictions in existing and emerging “pay-for-performance” programs, including implementation of California’s international offset provision, its value goes beyond this purpose.

The Standard is focused on *jurisdictional*²⁶⁻²⁸, or “sector-wide”, strategies for slowing the loss of tropical forests while improving the livelihoods and participation of forest communities within a broader transition to low-emission development. Jurisdictional strategies seek systemic solutions to deforestation, inadequate recognition of land rights, and other issues across entire political geographies—states and provinces—and are much less susceptible to leakage and dubious carbon accounting than some of the project-based examples that have been cited by others.

4. The CTFS already reflects important progress made in fostering stronger partnerships between tropical forest governments and indigenous peoples

One of the highlights of the Global Climate Action Summit in San Francisco last September was the announcement of “[Guiding Principles for Collaboration and Partnership between Subnational Governments, Indigenous Peoples and Local Communities](#).” State and provincial governments that are members of the Governors’ Climate and Forests Task Force endorsed these principles and shook hands with the democratically-elected leaders of key Indigenous Peoples organizations in Indonesia (AMAN), Central America and Mexico (AMPB) and the Amazon (COICA). In all, 35 governments, 18 Indigenous Peoples organizations, and 17 environmental NGOs endorsed these principles, which have now been incorporated into the CTFS.

These partnerships are already happening, as has been [documented](#) for the State of Acre, in the Brazilian Amazon, which has a 20-year partnership between the state government and the Indigenous Peoples who reside in the state.²⁸

Conclusion: To unlock the potential of tropical forests as a climate change solution, it is urgent that the California Tropical Forest Standard be endorsed. New governments in many tropical forest regions have just been elected and will define their major priorities in the next few months. If endorsement is postponed, an important opportunity will be lost to send the signal that California, in its role as a global leader of climate change

solutions, recognizes and supports bold efforts to address climate change by slowing the loss and speeding the recovery of tropical forests.

Signatories as of November 16, 2018, alphabetical by last name:

[Total Number = 118; Members of the USA National Academy of Sciences = 8; IPCC lead authors = 8; MacArthur Genius Award recipients = 3]

Dr. Ryan Abman, Economist, Assistant Professor, San Diego State University

Dr. Ane Alencar, Amazon Fire and Indigenous Territory Monitoring, Researcher, Amazon Institute of Environmental Research (IPAM)

Dr. Christa Anderson, Ecologist and California Offsets Expert, Stanford University

Kenneth Andrasko, President and CEO, AltaVerde Consulting, Expert in Climate Change Policy, Forest Carbon Finance and Low Emissions Development (Lead Author of IPCC Assessment reports (2); IPCC Contributing Author)

Dr. Arild Angelsen, Economist, REDD+ Expert, Norwegian University of Life Sciences

Dr. Greg Asner, Forest Monitoring Expert, Ecologist, Staff Scientist, Carnegie Institute of Science, California (Member of National Academy of Sciences, USA)

Dr. Nigel Asquith, Watershed Management, Director, Natura Bolivia Foundation

Dr. Alessandro Baccini, Remote Sensing Expert, Associate Scientist, Woods Hole Research Institute

Dr. Allen Blackman, Senior Fellow, Resources for the Future

Dr. Rizaldi Boer, Center for Climate Risk and Opportunity Management in Southeast Asia and Pacific, Bogor Agricultural University, Indonesia

Dr. Fred Boltz, Natural Resource Economist, CEO, Resolute Development Solutions.

Dr. William Boyd, Forest and Climate Governance and Law, Professor, UCLA Law School.

Dr. Paulo Brando, Ecologist and Forest Fire Expert. Assistant Scientist, Woods Hole Research Center

Dr. I. Foster Brown, Environmental Science and Amazon Expert, Professor, Woods Hole Research Center and Universidade Federal do Acre (Brazil)

Dr. Zuzana Burivalova, Conservation Scientist Specializing in Tropical Forests, Princeton University

Dr. Jonah Busch, Natural Resource Economics and Tropical Forest Expert, Chief Economist, Earth Innovation Institute

Dr. Kimberly Carlson, Environmental Scientist, Assistant Professor, Dept. of Natural Resources and Environmental Management, University of Hawai'i

Dr. Roman Carrasco, Environmental Economist, Assistant Professor, National University of Singapore

Dr. Jill Caviglia-Harris, Professor of Economics, Economics and Finance Department, Environmental Studies Department, Salisbury University, Maryland

Dr. Jeff Chambers, Forest Ecosystem Ecologist, Professor of Geography, University of California Berkeley

Dr. Robin Chazdon, Professor Emerita, Ecologist, University of Connecticut

Dr. Ashwini Chhatre, Associate Professor of Public Policy, Indian School of Business

Dr. James Clark, Statistical Sciences, Professor, Duke University

Dr. Stefano Crema, Chief Application Research Officer, Clark Labs, Clark University

Dr. Lisa Curran, Ecologist and Indonesia Expert, Professor, Stanford University

Dr. Gretchen C. Daily, Bing Professor of Environmental Science, Dept. of Biology and Woods Institute, Stanford University (Member of National Academy of Sciences, USA)

Dr. Ruth DeFries, Sustainability Science, Columbia University and National Academy of Sciences (Member of National Academy of Sciences, USA; Lead Author of IPCC AR4; MacArthur Genius Award Recipient)

Dr. Bernardus de Jong, Tropical Forest Ecologist, El Colegio de la Frontera Sur, Mexico

Dr. Rodolfo Dirzo, Ecologist, Professor, Stanford University (Member of National Academy of Sciences, USA)

Dr. Amy Duchelle, Ecologist and REDD+ Expert, Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR)

Dr. Phil Duffy, Physicist and Climate Change Expert, Executive Director, Woods Hole Research Center

Dr. Joanna Durbin, Ecologist and REDD Safeguards Expert, Conservation International

Dr. Andres Etter, Land Use Expert, Professor, Pontificia Javeriana University, Colombia

Dr. Paul “Chip” Fay, Social Scientist and Asia Forest Expert, Fellow, Samdhana Institute

Dr. Philip Fearnside, Ecologist and Amazon Expert, Scientist, National Amazon Research Institute (INPA, Brazil)

Dr. Chris Field, Director, Stanford Woods Institute for the Environment, Stanford University (Member of National Academy of Sciences, USA; IPCC Co-Chair and Lead Author)

Dr. Bruce Forsberg, Aquatic Ecologist and Amazon Expert, Researcher, National Amazon Research Institute (INPA, Brazil)

Dr. Jason Funk, Associate Director for Land Use, Carbon180

Dr. Sabine Fuss, Head of Working Group for “Sustainable Resource Management and Global Change”, Mercator Research Institute on Global Commons and Climate Change;

Professor, Faculty of Natural Sciences and Mathematics, Geographical Institute,
Humboldt University of Berlin, Germany

Dr. David L.A. Gaveau, Associate, Center for International Forestry Research

Dr. Holly Gibbs, Professor, University of Wisconsin-Madison

Dr. Scott Goetz, Professor, School of Informatics, Computing and Cyber Systems,
Northern Arizona University

Dr. Rose Goodman, Assist. Professor, Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences

Dr. Hedley Grantham, Director, Conservation Planning, Wildlife Conservation Society

Dr. Bronson Griscom, Director, Forest Carbon Science, The Nature Conservancy

Dr. Steven P. Hamburg, Forest Ecologist, Chief Scientist, Environmental Defense Fund
(IPCC Lead Author)

Dr. Lee Hannah, Senior Research Fellow, Climate Change Biologist, Conservation
International, Adjunct Faculty, Bren School of Environmental Science and Management,
UCSB

Dr. Susanna Hecht, Geographer, Professor, University of California, Los Angeles

Dr. Laura Hess, Associate Researcher, University of California, Santa Barbara

Dr. Ove Hoegh-Guldberg, Professor, University of Queensland

Dr. Margaret Buck Holland, Associate Professor, Dept. of Geography and Environmental
Systems, University of Maryland

Dr. Richard Houghton, Ecologist and Carbon Budget Expert, Senior Scientist, Woods
Hole Research Center (IPCC Lead Author)

Dr. Silvia Irawan, Public Policy and REDD+ Finance Expert, Managing Director, Institut
Penelitian Inovasi Bumi (INOBU), Indonesia

Dr. Bruce Jennings, Senior Fellow, Center for Humans and Nature, Adjunct Associate
Professor, Vanderbilt University, Senior Advisor, The Hasting Center

Dr. David Kaimowitz, former Director General, Center for International Forestry
Research

Dr. Daniel Kammen, Professor of Energy, Energy and Resources Group, UC Berkeley

Dr. Nikolay Khabarov, Research Scholar, Ecosystems Services and Management
Program, International Institute for Applied Systems Analysis, Austria

Dr. Torsten Krause, Associate Senior Lecturer, Lund University, Sweden

Dr. Florian Kraxner, Deputy Director, Senior Research Scholar, Ecosystem Services and
Management, International Institute for Applied Systems Analysis, Austria

Dr. Claire Kremen, Professor, Dept. of Environmental Sciences Policy and Management,
UC Berkeley (MacArthur Genius Award Recipient)

Dr. Eric Lambin, 2014 Laureate Volvo Environment Prize, Foreign Associate of the National Academy of Sciences, USA, Academia Europaea, European Academy of Sciences, Académie Royale des sciences, des lettres & des beaux-arts de Belgique

Dr. William Laurance, Ecologist, Tropical Forest Expert, Professor, James Cook University, Cairns, Australia (Member of National Academy of Science, Australia; IPCC Contributing Author)

Dr. Beverly Law, Forest Ecologist, Oregon State University

Dr. Kathleen Lawlor, Assistant Professor of Economics, University of North Carolina Asheville

Dr. Thomas Lovejoy, Ecologist, Amazon Specialist, United Nations Foundation

Dr. Ruben Lubowski, Chief Natural Resource Economist, Environmental Defense Fund

Dr. Colleen Scanlan Lyons, Anthropologist, Research Professor, University of Colorado

Dr. Marcia Macedo, Tropical Ecology and Land Use Specialist, Assistant Scientist, Woods Hole Research Center

Dr. Katharine Mach, Ecologist, Senior Research Scientist, Stanford University (IPCC Co-Director of Science and Lead Author)

Dr. Christopher Martius, Team Leader Climate Change, Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR)

Dr. David Marvin, Remote Sensing Expert & Tropical Ecologist, Co-Founder & CEO, Salo Sciences Inc., San Francisco, California

Dr. Bruce McCarl, University Distinguished Professor, Department of Agricultural Economics, Texas A&M University

Dr. David G. McGrath, Geographer and Amazon Specialist, Senior Scientist, Earth Innovation Institute

Dr. Jeff Milder, Ecologist, Director of Global Programs, Rainforest Alliance & Adjunct Professor, Cornell University

Dr. Daniela Miteva, Assistant Professor of Sustainable Development and Economy, The Ohio State University

Dr. William R. Moomaw, Emeritus Professor, International Environmental Policy, The Fletcher School and Co-director of Global Development and Environment Institute, Tufts University

Dr. Harold Mooney, Ecologist, Professor Emeritus, Stanford University (Member of National Academy of Sciences, USA)

Dr. Paulo Moutinho, Ecologist and Amazon Expert. Senior Scientist, Amazon Institute of Environmental Research (IPAM), Brazil

Dr. Katrina Mullan, Associate Professor of Economics, University of Montana

Dr. Rosamond Naylor, Economist and Food Systems Expert, Professor, Stanford University

Dr. Daniel Nepstad, Ecologist and Amazon Specialist, President, Earth Innovation Institute (IPCC Lead Author)

Dr. Paulo Artaxo Neto, Atmospheric Chemist and Amazon Specialist, Professor, Universidade de São Paulo, Brazil (IPCC Lead Author)

Dr. Peter Newton, Assistant Professor, Environmental Studies Program, University of Colorado

Dr. Michael Obersteiner, Ecosystem Modeler, Program Director, IIASA

Dr. Charles Palmer, Associate Professor of Environment & Development, Department of Geography & Environment, London School of Economics

Dr. Steven Panfil, Senior Director, Project Development and Implementation, CI Green Climate Fund Agency, Conservation International

Dr. Martin Persson, Associate Professor, Department of Energy & Environment, Chalmers University of Technology

Dr. Charles M. Peters, Ecologist and Tropical Forest Management Expert, Scientist (Emeritus), New York Botanical Garden

Dr. Jacob Phelps, Lancaster Environment Centre, Lancaster University

Dr. Andrew Plantiga, Bren School of Environmental Science and Management, UC Santa Barbara

Dr. Catherine Potvin, Canada Research Chair on Climate Mitigation and Tropical Forests; Professor, Department of Biology, McGill University

Dr. Francis E. Putz, Distinguished Professor, Department of Biology, University of Florida

Dr. Navin Ramankutty, Land System Scientist, Professor, University of British Columbia

Dr. Peter Raven, President Emeritus, Missouri Botanical Garden (Member of National Academy of Sciences, USA; MacArthur Genius Award Recipient)

Dr. Tom Rudel, Distinguished Professor Emeritus, Rutgers University

Dr. Daddy Ruhayat, Tropical Forest Soil Scientist, Professor, Mulawarman University, East Kalimantan, Indonesia

Dr. Jeff Sayer, Professor of Tropical Forest Conservation, University of British Columbia

Dr. Stephen Schwartzman, Anthropologist, Amazon Specialist, Environmental Defense Fund

Frances Seymour, Former Director General, Center for International Forestry Research

Dr. Priya Shyamsundar, Lead Economist, Global Science, The Nature Conservancy

Dr. Erin Sills, Department of Forestry and Environmental Resources, North Carolina State University

Dr. Thomas B. Smith, Ecologist, Professor of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, UCLA; Co-Executive Director, Congo Basin Institute; Director, Center for Tropical Research, Institute of the Environment and Sustainability, UCLA

Dr. Claudia Stickler, Tropical Land-Use Expert, Earth Innovation Institute

Dr. Charlotta Streck, International Climate Policy Expert, Director, Climate Focus

Dr. Brent Swallow, Resource Economist, Professor, University of Alberta

Dr. Luca Tacconi, Professor of Environmental Governance, Crawford School of Public Policy, The Australian National University

Dr. Will Turner, Climate Science and Forest Conservation Expert, Senior Scientist, Conservation International

Dr. Reynaldo Victoria, Hydrologist, Amazon Specialist, Universidade de São Paulo, Brazil (Emeritus)

Dr. Wayne Walker, Remote Sensing Expert, Associate Scientist, Woods Hole Research Center

Dr. Matthew Warren, Tropical Forest Ecologist, Research Associate, Earth Innovation Institute

Dr. James Watson, Professor of Conservation Science, Founding Chair of the IUCN's Climate Change Specialist Group and Director of the Centre for Biodiversity and Conservation Science at the University of Queensland

Dr. John Watts, Anthropologist and Indonesia Expert, Director of Research, Institut Penelitian Inovasi Bumi (INOBU), Indonesia

Dr. Edward Webb, California Native, Concerned Citizen and Environmental Scientist, Associate Professor, Department of Biological Sciences, National University of Singapore

Dr. Diana Weinhold, London School of Economics

Dr. David S. Wilcove, Professor of Ecology, Evolutionary Biology and Public Affairs, Princeton University

Dr. Michael Wolosin, Ecologist and Tropical Deforestation Expert, Forest Climate Analytics

Dr. George Woodwell, Founder, Senior Scientist, Woods Hole Research Center (Member of National Academy of Sciences, USA)

Dr. Sven Wunder, Natural Resource Economist, Principal Scientist, European Forest Institute

References Cited in the Letter

1. Houghton, R.A., Byers, B., Nassikas, A.A., 2015. A role for tropical forests in stabilizing atmospheric CO₂. *Nature Climate Change* 5, 1022–1023. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate2869>

2. Seymour, F., Busch, J., 2016. Why forests? Why now? The science, economics, and politics of tropical forests and climate change. Center for Global Development, Washington DC.
3. Griscom, B.W., Adams, J., Ellis, P.W., Houghton, R.A., Lomax, G., Miteva, D.A., Schlesinger, W.H., Shoch, D., Siikamäki, J.V., Smith, P., Woodbury, P., Zganjar, C., Blackman, A., Campari, J., Conant, R.T., Delgado, C., Elias, P., Gopalakrishna, T., Hamsik, M.R., Herrero, M., Kiesecker, J., Landis, E., Laestadius, L., Leavitt, S.M., Minnemeyer, S., Polasky, S., Potapov, P., Putz, F.E., Sanderman, J., Silvius, M., Wollenberg, E., Fargione, J., 2017. Natural climate solutions. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 114, 11645–11650. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1710465114>
4. Pan, Y., Birdsey, R.A., Fang, J., Houghton, R., Kauppi, P.E., Kurz, W.A., Phillips, O.L., Shvidenko, A., Lewis, S.L., Canadell, J.G., Ciais, P., Jackson, R.B., Pacala, S.W., McGuire, A.D., Piao, S., Rautiainen, A., Sitch, S., Hayes, D., 2011. A Large and Persistent Carbon Sink in the World's Forests. *Science* 333, 988–993. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1201609>
5. Baccini, A., Goetz, S.J., Walker, W.S., Laporte, N.T., Sun, M., Sulla-Menashe, D., Hackler, J., Beck, P.S.A., Dubayah, R., Friedl, M.A., Samanta, S., Houghton, R.A., 2012. Estimated carbon dioxide emissions from tropical deforestation improved by carbon-density maps. *Nature Climate Change* 2, 182–185. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate1354>
6. Harris, N.L., Brown, S., Hagen, S.C., Saatchi, S.S., Petrova, S., Salas, W., Hansen, M.C., Potapov, P.V., Lutsch, A., 2012. Baseline Map of Carbon Emissions from Deforestation in Tropical Regions. *Science* 336, 1573–1576. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1217962>
7. Achard, F., Beuchle, R., Mayaux, P., Stibig, H.-J., Bodart, C., Brink, A., Carboni, S., Desclée, B., Donnay, F., Eva, H.D., Lupi, A., Raši, R., Seliger, R., Simonetti, D., 2014. Determination of tropical deforestation rates and related carbon losses from 1990 to 2010. *Global Change Biology* 20, 2540–2554. <https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.12605>
8. Grace, J., Mitchard, E., Gloor, E., 2014. Perturbations in the carbon budget of the tropics. *Global Change Biology* 20, 3238–3255. <https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.12600>
9. Tubiello, F.N., Salvatore, M., Ferrara, A.F., House, J., Federici, S., Rossi, S., Biancalani, R., Condor Golec, R.D., Jacobs, H., Flammini, A., Prospero, P., Cardenas-Galindo, P., Schmidhuber, J., Sanz Sanchez, M.J., Srivastava, N., Smith, P., 2015. The Contribution of Agriculture, Forestry and other Land Use activities to Global Warming, 1990-2012. *Global Change Biology* 21, 2655–2660. <https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.12865>
10. Liu, Y.Y., van Dijk, A.I.J.M., de Jeu, R.A.M., Canadell, J.G., McCabe, M.F., Evans, J.P., Wang, G., 2015. Recent reversal in loss of global terrestrial biomass. *Nature Climate Change* 5, 470–474. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate2581>
11. Zarin, D.J., Harris, N.L., Baccini, A., Aksenov, D., Hansen, M.C., Azevedo-Ramos, C., Azevedo, T., Margono, B.A., Alencar, A.C., Gabris, C., Allegretti, A., Potapov, P., Farina, M., Walker, W.S., Shevade, V.S., Loboda, T.V., Turubanova, S., Tyukavina, A., 2016. Can carbon emissions from tropical deforestation drop by 50% in 5 years? *Global Change Biology* 22, 1336–1347. <https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.13153>

12. Smith, P., Bustamante, M., Ahammad, H., Clark, H., Dong, H., Elsiddig, E.A., Haberl, H., Harper, R., House, J., Jafari, M., Masera, O., Mbow, C., Ravindranath, N.H., Rice, C.W., Robledo Abad, C., Romanovskaya, A., Sperling, F., Tubiello, F., 2014. Agriculture, Forestry and Other Land Use (AFOLU), in: Edenhofer, O., Pichs-Madruga, R., Sokona, Y., Farahani, E., Kadner, S., Seyboth, K., Adler, A., Baum, I., Brunner, S., Eickemeier, P., Kriemann, B., Savolainen, J., Schlömer, S., von Stechow, C., Zwickel, T., Minx, J.C. (Eds.), *Climate Change 2014: Mitigation of Climate Change. Contribution of Working Group III to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA.
13. Silver, W.L., Ostertag, R., Lugo, A.E., 2000. The Potential for Carbon Sequestration Through Reforestation of Abandoned Tropical Agricultural and Pasture Lands. *Restoration Ecology* 8, 394–407. <https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1526-100x.2000.80054.x>
14. Gilroy, J.J., Woodcock, P., Edwards, F.A., Wheeler, C., Baptiste, B.L.G., Medina Uribe, C.A., Haugaasen, T., Edwards, D.P., 2014. Cheap carbon and biodiversity co-benefits from forest regeneration in a hotspot of endemism. *Nature Climate Change* 4, 503–507. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate2200>
15. Chazdon, R.L., Guariguata, M.R., 2016. Natural regeneration as a tool for large-scale forest restoration in the tropics: prospects and challenges. *Biotropica* 48, 716–730. <https://doi.org/10.1111/btp.12381>
16. Hawes, M., 2018. Planting carbon storage. *Nature Climate Change* 8, 556–558. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41558-018-0214-x>
17. Kindermann, G., Obersteiner, M., Sohngen, B., Sathaye, J., Andrasko, K., Rametsteiner, E., Schlamadinger, B., Wunder, S., Beach, R., 2008. Global cost estimates of reducing carbon emissions through avoided deforestation. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 105, 10302–10307. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0710616105>
18. Strassburg, B., Turner, R.K., Fisher, B., Schaeffer, R., Lovett, A., 2009. Reducing emissions from deforestation—The “combined incentives” mechanism and empirical simulations. *Global Environmental Change* 19, 265–278. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2008.11.004>
19. Coren, M.J., Streck, C., Madeira, E.M., 2011. Estimated supply of RED credits 2011–2035. *Climate Policy* 11, 1272–1288. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14693062.2011.579318>
20. Busch, J., Engelmann, J., 2017. Cost-effectiveness of reducing emissions from tropical deforestation, 2016–2050. *Environmental Research Letters* 13, 015001. <https://doi.org/10.1088/1748-9326/aa907c>
21. Busch J et al (2012) Structuring economic incentives to reduce emissions from deforestation within Indonesia. *Proc Nat Acad Sci USA* 109(4):1062-1067.
22. Fuss, S., Lamb, W.F., Callaghan, M.W., Hilaire, J., Creutzig, F., Amann, T., Beringer, T., de Oliveira Garcia, W., Hartmann, J., Khanna, T., Luderer, G., Nemet, G.F., Rogelj, J., Smith, P., Vicente, J.L.V., Wilcox, J., del Mar Zamora Dominguez, M., Minx, J.C., 2018. Negative emissions—Part 2: Costs, potentials and side effects. *Environmental Research Letters* 13, 063002. <https://doi.org/10.1088/1748-9326/aabf9f>
23. Edwards, D.P., Fisher, B., Boyd, E., 2010. Protecting degraded rainforests: enhancement of forest carbon stocks under REDD+: Enhancing forest carbon with

- REDD+. *Conservation Letters* 3, 313–316. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1755-263X.2010.00143.x>
24. Nepstad, D., Irawan, S., Bezerra, T., Boyd, W., Stickler, C., Shimada, J., Carvalho, O., MacIntyre, K., Dohong, A., Alencar, A., Azevedo, A., Tepper, D., Lowery, S., 2013. More food, more forests, fewer emissions, better livelihoods: linking REDD+, sustainable supply chains and domestic policy in Brazil, Indonesia and Colombia. *Carbon Management* 4, 639–658. <https://doi.org/10.4155/cmt.13.65>
 25. Nepstad, D., McGrath, D., Stickler, C., Alencar, A., Azevedo, A., Swette, B., Bezerra, T., DiGiano, M., Shimada, J., Seroa da Motta, R., Armijo, E., Castello, L., Brando, P., Hansen, M.C., McGrath-Horn, M., Carvalho, O., Hess, L., 2014. Slowing Amazon deforestation through public policy and interventions in beef and soy supply chains. *Science* 344, 1118–1123. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1248525>
 26. Boyd, W., Stickler, C., Duchelle, A.E., Seymour, F., Nepstad, D., Bahar, N.H.A., Rodriguez Ward, D., 2018. Jurisdictional Approaches to REDD+ and Low Emissions Development: Progress and Prospects. Working Paper. Presented at the Oslo Tropical Forest Forum, Oslo, World Resources Institute, Washington, DC.
 27. Stickler, CM et al. 2018. The State of Jurisdictional Sustainability. San Francisco, USA: Earth Innovation Institute/Bogor, Indonesia: Center for International Forestry Research/Boulder, USA: Governors’ Climate and Forests Task Force Secretariat.
 28. DiGiano, M., Mendoza, E., Ochoa, M.L., Ardila, J., Oliviera de Lima, F., Nepstad, D. 2018. The twenty –year-old partnership between indigenous peoples and the Government of Acre, Brazil. Earth Innovation Institute, Collaboration for Climate series, San Francisco USA.

Sample of Other Relevant Publications by Signatory Scientists

- Agrawal, A., Chhatre, A., Hardin, R., 2008. Changing Governance of the World’s Forests. *Science* 320, 1460–1462. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1155369>
- Agrawal, A., Nepstad, D., Chhatre, A., 2011. Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation. *Annual Review of Environment and Resources* 36, 373–396. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-environ-042009-094508>
- Angelsen, A. (Ed.), 2008. Moving ahead with REDD: Issues, options and implications. Center for International Forestry Research, Bogor, Indonesia.
- Angelsen, A., Brockhaus, M., Kanninen, M., Sills, E., Sunderlin, W.D., Wertz-Kanounnikoff, S. (Eds.), 2009. Realising REDD+: National strategy and policy options. Center for International Forestry Research, Bogor, Indonesia.
- Angelsen, A., Brockhaus, M., Sunderlin, W.D., Verchot, L.V. (Eds.), 2012. Analysing REDD+: Challenges and choices. Center for International Forestry Research, Bogor, Indonesia.
- Angelsen, A., Kaimowitz, D., 1999. Rethinking the Causes of Deforestation: Lessons from Economic Models. *The World Bank Research Observer* 14, 73–98. <https://doi.org/10.1093/wbro/14.1.73>

- Angelsen, A., Kaimowitz, D. (Eds.), 2001. Agricultural technologies and tropical deforestation. CABI Pub. in association with Center for International Forestry Research, Wallingford, Oxon, UK ; New York, NY, USA.
- Arriagada, R.A., Ferraro, P.J., Sills, E.O., Pattanayak, S.K., Cordero-Sancho, S., 2012. Do Payments for Environmental Services Affect Forest Cover? A Farm-Level Evaluation from Costa Rica. *Land Economics* 88, 382–399.
- Asner, G.P., 2005. Selective Logging in the Brazilian Amazon. *Science* 310, 480–482. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1118051>
- Asner, G.P., Rudel, T.K., Aide, T.M., Defries, R., Emerson, R., 2009. A Contemporary Assessment of Change in Humid Tropical Forests. *Conservation Biology* 23, 1386–1395. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1523-1739.2009.01333.x>
- Baccini, A., Goetz, S.J., Walker, W.S., Laporte, N.T., Sun, M., Sulla-Menashe, D., Hackler, J., Beck, P.S.A., Dubayah, R., Friedl, M.A., Samanta, S., Houghton, R.A., 2012. Estimated carbon dioxide emissions from tropical deforestation improved by carbon-density maps. *Nature Climate Change* 2, 182–185. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate1354>
- Baccini, A., Walker, W., Carvalho, L., Farina, M., Sulla-Menashe, D., Houghton, R.A., 2017. Tropical forests are a net carbon source based on aboveground measurements of gain and loss. *Science* 358, 230–234. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aam5962>
- Balch, J.K., Brando, P.M., Nepstad, D.C., Coe, M.T., Silvério, D., Massad, T.J., Davidson, E.A., Lefebvre, P., Oliveira-Santos, C., Rocha, W., Cury, R.T.S., Parsons, A., Carvalho, K.S., 2015. The Susceptibility of Southeastern Amazon Forests to Fire: Insights from a Large-Scale Burn Experiment. *BioScience* 65, 893–905. <https://doi.org/10.1093/biosci/biv106>
- Bierregaard, R.O., Lovejoy, T.E., Kapos, V., Hutchings, R.W., 1992. The Biological Dynamics of Tropical Rainforest Fragments. *BioScience* 42, 859–866. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1312085>
- Brando, P.M., Nepstad, D.C., Balch, J.K., Bolker, B., Christman, M.C., Coe, M., Putz, F.E., 2012. Fire-induced tree mortality in a neotropical forest: the roles of bark traits, tree size, wood density and fire behavior. *Global Change Biology* 18, 630–641. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2011.02533.x>
- Caplow, S., Jagger, P., Lawlor, K., Sills, E., 2011. Evaluating land use and livelihood impacts of early forest carbon projects: Lessons for learning about REDD+. *Environmental Science & Policy* 14, 152–167. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envsci.2010.10.003>
- Carlson, K.M., Curran, L.M., Asner, G.P., Pittman, A.M., Trigg, S.N., Marion Adeney, J., 2013. Carbon emissions from forest conversion by Kalimantan oil palm plantations. *Nature Climate Change* 3, 283–287. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate1702>
- Carlson, K.M., Curran, L.M., Ratnasari, D., Pittman, A.M., Soares-Filho, B.S., Asner, G.P., Trigg, S.N., Gaveau, D.A., Lawrence, D., Rodrigues, H.O., 2012. Committed carbon emissions, deforestation, and community land conversion from oil palm

- plantation expansion in West Kalimantan, Indonesia. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 109, 7559–7564. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1200452109>
- Carrasco, L.R., Larrosa, C., Milner-Gulland, E.J., Edwards, D.P., 2014. A double-edged sword for tropical forests. *Science* 346, 38–40. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1256685>
- Caviglia-Harris, J.L., Sills, E.O., 2005. Land use and income diversification: comparing traditional and colonist populations in the Brazilian Amazon. *Agricultural Economics* 32, 221–237. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1574-0862.2005.00238.x>
- Chave, J., Andalo, C., Brown, S., Cairns, M.A., Chambers, J.Q., Eamus, D., Fölster, H., Fromard, F., Higuchi, N., Kira, T., Lescure, J.-P., Nelson, B.W., Ogawa, H., Puig, H., Riéra, B., Yamakura, T., 2005. Tree allometry and improved estimation of carbon stocks and balance in tropical forests. *Oecologia* 145, 87–99. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00442-005-0100-x>
- Chazdon, R.L., 2008. Beyond Deforestation: Restoring Forests and Ecosystem Services on Degraded Lands. *Science* 320, 1458–1460. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1155365>
- Chazdon, R.L., 2003. Tropical forest recovery: legacies of human impact and natural disturbances. *Perspectives in Plant Ecology, Evolution and Systematics* 6, 51–71. <https://doi.org/10.1078/1433-8319-00042>
- DeFries, R.S., Houghton, R.A., Hansen, M.C., Field, C.B., Skole, D., Townshend, J., 2002. Carbon emissions from tropical deforestation and regrowth based on satellite observations for the 1980s and 1990s. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 99, 14256–14261. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.182560099>
- DeFries, R.S., Rudel, T., Uriarte, M., Hansen, M., 2010. Deforestation driven by urban population growth and agricultural trade in the twenty-first century. *Nature Geoscience* 3, 178–181. <https://doi.org/10.1038/ngeo756>
- Duchelle, A.E., Cromberg, M., Gebara, M.F., Guerra, R., Melo, T., Larson, A., Cronkleton, P., Börner, J., Sills, E., Wunder, S., Bauch, S., May, P., Selaya, G., Sunderlin, W.D., 2014. Linking Forest Tenure Reform, Environmental Compliance, and Incentives: Lessons from REDD+ Initiatives in the Brazilian Amazon. *World Development* 55, 53–67. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2013.01.014>
- Engel, S., Palmer, C. (Eds.), 2009. *Avoided deforestation: prospects for mitigating climate change*, Routledge explorations in environmental economics. Routledge, London ; New York.
- Etter, A., McAlpine, C., Wilson, K., Phinn, S., Possingham, H., 2006. Regional patterns of agricultural land use and deforestation in Colombia. *Agriculture, Ecosystems & Environment* 114, 369–386. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2005.11.013>
- Fahey, T.J., Woodbury, P.B., Battles, J.J., Goodale, C.L., Hamburg, S.P., Ollinger, S.V., Woodall, C.W., 2010. Forest carbon storage: ecology, management, and policy. *Frontiers in Ecology and the Environment* 8, 245–252. <https://doi.org/10.1890/080169>

- Field, C.B., Barros, V., Stocker, T., Dahe, Q., Dokken, D.J., Ebi, K., Mastrandrea, M., Mach, K., Plattner, G.K., Allen, S., Tignor, M. (Eds.), 2012. Managing the risks of extreme events and disasters to advance climate change adaptation: special report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. Cambridge University Press, New York, NY.
- Field, C.B., Barros, V.R., Dokken, D.J., Mach, K.J., Mastrandrea, M.D., Bilir, T.E., Chatterjee, M., Ebi, K.L., Estrada, Y.O., Genova, R.C., Girma, B. (Eds.), 2014. Climate change 2014: impacts, adaptation, and vulnerability: Working Group II contribution to the fifth assessment report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. Cambridge University Press, New York, NY.
- Foley, J.A., DeFries, R., Asner, G.P., Barford, C., Bonan, G., Carpenter, S.R., Chapin, F.S., Coe, M.T., Daily, G.C., Gibbs, H.K., Helkowski, J.H., Holloway, T., Howard, E.A., Kucharik, C.J., Monfreda, C., Patz, J.A., Prentice, C., Ramankutty, N., Snyder, P.K., 2005. Global Consequences of Land Use. *Science* 309, 570–574. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1111772>
- Foley, J.A., Asner, G.P., Costa, M.H., Coe, M.T., DeFries, R., Gibbs, H.K., Howard, E.A., Olson, S., Patz, J., Ramankutty, N., Snyder, P., 2007. Amazonia revealed: forest degradation and loss of ecosystem goods and services in the Amazon Basin. *Frontiers in Ecology and the Environment* 5, 25–32. [https://doi.org/10.1890/1540-9295\(2007\)5\[25:ARFDAL\]2.0.CO;2](https://doi.org/10.1890/1540-9295(2007)5[25:ARFDAL]2.0.CO;2)
- Gaveau, D.L.A., Epting, J., Lyne, O., Linkie, M., Kumara, I., Kanninen, M., Leader-Williams, N., 2009. Evaluating whether protected areas reduce tropical deforestation in Sumatra. *Journal of Biogeography* 36, 2165–2175. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2699.2009.02147.x>
- Gaveau, D.L.A., Wandono, H., Setiabudi, F., 2007. Three decades of deforestation in southwest Sumatra: Have protected areas halted forest loss and logging, and promoted re-growth? *Biological Conservation* 134, 495–504. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocon.2006.08.035>
- Gibbs, H.K., Brown, S., Niles, J.O., Foley, J.A., 2007. Monitoring and estimating tropical forest carbon stocks: making REDD a reality. *Environmental Research Letters* 2, 045023. <https://doi.org/10.1088/1748-9326/2/4/045023>
- Gibbs, H.K., Ruesch, A.S., Achard, F., Clayton, M.K., Holmgren, P., Ramankutty, N., Foley, J.A., 2010. Tropical forests were the primary sources of new agricultural land in the 1980s and 1990s. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 107, 16732–16737. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0910275107>
- Gibson, L., Lee, T.M., Koh, L.P., Brook, B.W., Gardner, T.A., Barlow, J., Peres, C.A., Bradshaw, C.J.A., Laurance, W.F., Lovejoy, T.E., Sodhi, N.S., 2011. Primary forests are irreplaceable for sustaining tropical biodiversity. *Nature* 478, 378–381. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nature10425>
- Gonçalves, F., Treuhaft, R., Law, B., Almeida, A., Walker, W., Baccini, A., dos Santos, J.R. and Graça, P., 2017. Estimating aboveground biomass in tropical forests: field methods and error analysis for the calibration of remote sensing observations. *Remote Sensing*, 9(1), p.47.

- Groom, B., Palmer, C., 2012. REDD+ and rural livelihoods. *Biological Conservation* 154, 42–52. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocon.2012.03.002>
- Gullison, R.E., Frumhoff, P.C., Canadell, J.G., Field, C.B., Nepstad, D.C., Hayhoe, K., Avissar, R., Curran, L.M., Friedlingstein, P., Jones, C.D., Nobre, C., 2007. ENVIRONMENT: Tropical Forests and Climate Policy. *Science* 316, 985–986. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1136163>
- Hansen, M.C., Potapov, P.V., Moore, R., Hancher, M., Turubanova, S.A., Tyukavina, A., Thau, D., Stehman, S.V., Goetz, S.J., Loveland, T.R., Kommareddy, A., Egorov, A., Chini, L., Justice, C.O., Townshend, J.R.G., 2013. High-Resolution Global Maps of 21st-Century Forest Cover Change. *Science* 342, 850–853. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1244693>
- Harris, N.L., Brown, S., Hagen, S.C., Saatchi, S.S., Petrova, S., Salas, W., Hansen, M.C., Potapov, P.V., Lotsch, A., 2012. Baseline Map of Carbon Emissions from Deforestation in Tropical Regions. *Science* 336, 1573–1576. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1217962>
- Hecht, S.B., Cockburn, A., 2010. *The fate of the forest: developers, destroyers, and defenders of the Amazon*, Updated ed. ed. University of Chicago Press, Chicago ; London.
- Houghton, R.A., 1991. Tropical Deforestation and Atmospheric Carbon Dioxide, in: Myers, N. (Ed.), *Tropical Forests and Climate*. Springer Netherlands, Dordrecht, pp. 99–118. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-017-3608-4_10
- Jagger, P., Sills, E., Lawlor, K., Sunderlin, W.D., 2010. A guide to learning about livelihood impacts of REDD+ projects. Occasional paper 56, CIFOR, Bogor, Indonesia.
- Kaimowitz, D., Angelsen, A., 1998. *Economic models of tropical deforestation: a review*. CIFOR, Center for International Forestry Research, Bogor, Indonesia.
- Kanninen, M., Murdiyarso, D., Seymour, F., Angelsen, A., Wunder, S., German, L. (Eds.), 2007. *Do trees grow on money? The implications of deforestation research for policies to promote REDD, Forest perspectives*. CIFOR, Center for International Forestry Research, Bogor, Indonesia.
- Larson, A.M., Brockhaus, M., Sunderlin, W.D., Duchelle, A., Babon, A., Dokken, T., Pham, T.T., Resosudarmo, I.A.P., Selaya, G., Awono, A., Huynh, T.-B., 2013. Land tenure and REDD+: The good, the bad and the ugly. *Global Environmental Change* 23, 678–689. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2013.02.014>
- Law, B.E., Hudiburg, T.W., Berner, L.T., Kent, J.J., Buotte, P.C. and Harmon, M.E., 2018. Land use strategies to mitigate climate change in carbon dense temperate forests. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, p.201720064.
- Lawlor, K., Madeira, E., Blockhus, J., Ganz, D., 2013. Community Participation and Benefits in REDD+: A Review of Initial Outcomes and Lessons. *Forests* 4, 296–318. <https://doi.org/10.3390/f4020296>

- Loarie, S.R., Duffy, P.B., Hamilton, H., Asner, G.P., Field, C.B., Ackerly, D.D., 2009. The velocity of climate change. *Nature* 462, 1052–1055. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nature08649>
- Lubowski, R.N., Plantinga, A.J., Stavins, R.N., 2006. Land-use change and carbon sinks: Econometric estimation of the carbon sequestration supply function. *Journal of Environmental Economics and Management* 51, 135–152. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jeem.2005.08.001>
- Marvin, D.C., Koh, L.P., Lynam, A.J., Wich, S., Davies, A.B., Krishnamurthy, R., Stokes, E., Starkey, R., Asner, G.P., 2016. Integrating technologies for scalable ecology and conservation. *Global Ecology and Conservation* 7, 262–275. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gecco.2016.07.002>
- Merry, F., Soares-Filho, B., Nepstad, D., Amacher, G., Rodrigues, H., 2009. Balancing Conservation and Economic Sustainability: The Future of the Amazon Timber Industry. *Environmental Management* 44, 395–407. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00267-009-9337-1>
- Meyfroidt, P., Carlson, K.M., Fagan, M.E., Gutiérrez-Vélez, V.H., Macedo, M.N., Curran, L.M., DeFries, R.S., Dyer, G.A., Gibbs, H.K., Lambin, E.F., Morton, D.C., Robiglio, V., 2014. Multiple pathways of commodity crop expansion in tropical forest landscapes. *Environmental Research Letters* 9, 074012. <https://doi.org/10.1088/1748-9326/9/7/074012>
- Moutinho, P., Schwartzman, S. (Eds.), 2005. Tropical deforestation and climate change. Instituto de Pesquisa Ambiental da Amazônia ; Environmental Defense, Brasília, DF, Brasil : Washington, DC.
- Murdiyarso, D., Purbopuspito, J., Kauffman, J.B., Warren, M.W., Sasmito, S.D., Donato, D.C., Manuri, S., Krisnawati, H., Taberima, S., Kurnianto, S., 2015. The potential of Indonesian mangrove forests for global climate change mitigation. *Nature Climate Change* 5, 1089–1092. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate2734>
- Nepstad, D., Carvalho, G., Cristina Barros, A., Alencar, A., Paulo Capobianco, J., Bishop, J., Moutinho, P., Lefebvre, P., Lopes Silva, U., Prins, E., 2001. Road paving, fire regime feedbacks, and the future of Amazon forests. *Forest Ecology and Management* 154, 395–407. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0378-1127\(01\)00511-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0378-1127(01)00511-4)
- Nepstad, D., Irawan, S., Bezerra, T., Boyd, W., Stickler, C., Shimada, J., Carvalho, O., MacIntyre, K., Dohong, A., Alencar, A., Azevedo, A., Tepper, D., Lowery, S., 2013. More food, more forests, fewer emissions, better livelihoods: linking REDD+, sustainable supply chains and domestic policy in Brazil, Indonesia and Colombia. *Carbon Management* 4, 639–658. <https://doi.org/10.4155/cmt.13.65>
- Nepstad, D., McGrath, D., Alencar, A., Barros, A.C., Carvalho, G., Santili, M., Vera Diaz, M. del C., 2002. Frontier Governance in Amazonia. *Science* 295, 629–631. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1067053>
- Nepstad, D., McGrath, D., Stickler, C., Alencar, A., Azevedo, A., Swette, B., Bezerra, T., DiGiano, M., Shimada, J., Seroa da Motta, R., Armijo, E., Castello, L., Brando, P., Hansen, M.C., McGrath-Horn, M., Carvalho, O., Hess, L., 2014. Slowing Amazon

- deforestation through public policy and interventions in beef and soy supply chains. *Science* 344, 1118–1123. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1248525>
- Nepstad, D., Schwartzman, S., Bamberger, B., Santilli, M., Ray, D., Schlesinger, P., Lefebvre, P., Alencar, A., Prinz, E., Fiske, G., Rolla, A., 2006. Inhibition of Amazon Deforestation and Fire by Parks and Indigenous Lands: Inhibition of Amazon Deforestation and Fire. *Conservation Biology* 20, 65–73. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1523-1739.2006.00351.x>
- Nepstad, D., Soares-Filho, B.S., Merry, F., Lima, A., Moutinho, P., Carter, J., Bowman, M., Cattaneo, A., Rodrigues, H., Schwartzman, S., McGrath, D.G., Stickler, C.M., Lubowski, R., Piris-Cabezas, P., Rivero, S., Alencar, A., Almeida, O., Stella, O., 2009. The End of Deforestation in the Brazilian Amazon. *Science* 326, 1350–1351. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1182108>
- Nepstad, D.C., Boyd, W., Stickler, C.M., Bezerra, T., Azevedo, A.A., 2013. Responding to climate change and the global land crisis: REDD+, market transformation and low-emissions rural development. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 368, 20120167–20120167. <https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2012.0167>
- Nepstad, D.C., de Carvalho, C.R., Davidson, E.A., Jipp, P.H., Lefebvre, P.A., Negreiros, G.H., da Silva, E.D., Stone, T.A., Trumbore, S.E., Vieira, S., 1994. The role of deep roots in the hydrological and carbon cycles of Amazonian forests and pastures. *Nature* 372, 666–669.
- Nepstad, D.C., Nobre, C., Lima, E., Lefebvre, P., Schlesinger, P., Potter, C., Mendoza, E., Cochrane, M., Brooks, V., 1999. Large-scale impoverishment of Amazonian forests by logging and fire 398, 4.
- Nepstad, D.C., Stickler, C.M., Filho, B.S., Merry, F., 2008. Interactions among Amazon land use, forests and climate: prospects for a near-term forest tipping point. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 363, 1737–1746. <https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2007.0036>
- Nepstad, D.C., Tohver, I.M., Ray, D., Moutinho, P., Cardinot, G., 2007. Mortality of Large Trees and Lianas Following Experimental Drought in an Amazon Forest. *Ecology* 88, 2259–2269. <https://doi.org/10.1890/06-1046.1>
- Newton, P., Agrawal, A., Wollenberg, L., 2013. Enhancing the sustainability of commodity supply chains in tropical forest and agricultural landscapes. *Global Environmental Change* 23, 1761–1772. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2013.08.004>
- Palmer, C., 2011. Property rights and liability for deforestation under REDD+: Implications for ‘permanence’ in policy design. *Ecological Economics* 70, 571–576. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2010.10.011>
- Pattanayak, S.K., Sills, E., 2001. Do tropical forests provide natural insurance? The microeconomics of non-timber forest product collection in the Brazilian Amazon. *Land Economics* 77, 595–612.

- Persson, U.M., Azar, C., 2010. Preserving the World's Tropical Forests—A Price on Carbon May Not Do. *Environmental Science & Technology* 44, 210–215. <https://doi.org/10.1021/es902629x>
- Phelps, J., Carrasco, L.R., Webb, E.L., Koh, L.P., Pascual, U., 2013. Agricultural intensification escalates future conservation costs. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 110, 7601–7606. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1220070110>
- Phelps, J., Friess, D.A., Webb, E.L., 2012. Win–win REDD+ approaches belie carbon–biodiversity trade-offs. *Biological Conservation* 154, 53–60. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocon.2011.12.031>
- Phelps, J., Guerrero, M.C., Dalabajan, D.A., Young, B., Webb, E.L., 2010a. What makes a ‘REDD’ country? *Global Environmental Change* 20, 322–332. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2010.01.002>
- Phelps, J., Webb, E. L., Adams, W. M., 2012. Biodiversity co-benefits of policies to reduce forest-carbon emissions. *Nature Climate Change* 2, 497–503. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate1462>
- Phelps, J., Webb, E.L., Agrawal, A., 2010b. Does REDD+ Threaten to Recentralize Forest Governance? *Science* 328, 312–313. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1187774>
- Putz, F.E., Zuidema, P.A., Synnott, T., Peña-Claros, M., Pinard, M.A., Sheil, D., Vanclay, J.K., Sist, P., Gourlet-Fleury, S., Griscom, B., Palmer, J., Zagt, R., 2012. Sustaining conservation values in selectively logged tropical forests: the attained and the attainable: Sustaining tropical forests with forestry. *Conservation Letters* 5, 296–303. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1755-263X.2012.00242.x>
- Ramankutty, N., Gibbs, H.K., Achard, F., Defries, R., Foley, J.A., Houghton, R.A., 2007. Challenges to estimating carbon emissions from tropical deforestation. *Global Change Biology* 13, 51–66. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2006.01272.x>
- Robinson, B.E., Holland, M.B., Naughton-Treves, L., 2014. Does secure land tenure save forests? A meta-analysis of the relationship between land tenure and tropical deforestation. *Global Environmental Change* 29, 281–293. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2013.05.012>
- Rode, J., Gómez-Baggethun, E., Krause, T., 2015. Motivation crowding by economic incentives in conservation policy: A review of the empirical evidence. *Ecological Economics* 117, 270–282. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2014.11.019>
- Rudel, T., Roper, J., 1997. The paths to rain forest destruction: Crossnational patterns of tropical deforestation, 1975–1990. *World Development* 25, 53–65. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0305-750X\(96\)00086-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0305-750X(96)00086-1)
- Rudel, T.K., 2007. Changing agents of deforestation: From state-initiated to enterprise driven processes, 1970–2000. *Land Use Policy* 24, 35–41. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landusepol.2005.11.004>
- Rudel, T.K., 1998. Is There a Forest Transition? Deforestation, Reforestation, and Development. *Rural Sociology* 63, 533–552. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1549-0831.1998.tb00691.x>

- Rudel, T.K., 1989. Population, Development, and Tropical Deforestation: A Cross-national Study. *Rural Sociology* 54, 327–338.
- Rudel, T.K., Coomes, O.T., Moran, E., Achard, F., Angelsen, A., Xu, J., Lambin, E., 2005. Forest transitions: towards a global understanding of land use change. *Global Environmental Change* 15, 23–31. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2004.11.001>
- Rudel, T.K., Defries, R., Asner, G.P., Laurance, W.F., 2009. Changing Drivers of Deforestation and New Opportunities for Conservation. *Conservation Biology* 23, 1396–1405. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1523-1739.2009.01332.x>
- Saatchi, S.S., Harris, N.L., Brown, S., Lefsky, M., Mitchard, E.T.A., Salas, W., Zutta, B.R., Buermann, W., Lewis, S.L., Hagen, S., Petrova, S., White, L., Silman, M., Morel, A., 2011. Benchmark map of forest carbon stocks in tropical regions across three continents. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 108, 9899–9904. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1019576108>
- Santilli, M., Moutinho, P., Schwartzman, S., Nepstad, D., Curran, L., Nobre, C., 2005. Tropical Deforestation and the Kyoto Protocol. *Climatic Change* 71, 267–276. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10584-005-8074-6>
- Scherr, S.J., White, A., Kaimowitz, D., 2004. A new agenda for forest conservation and poverty reduction: making forest markets work for low-income producers. *Forest Trends*, Washington, D.C.
- Schneider, C.J., Smith, T.B., Larison, B., Moritz, C., 1999. A test of alternative models of diversification in tropical rainforests: Ecological gradients vs. rainforest refugia. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 96, 13869–13873. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.96.24.13869>
- Shyamsundar, P., Kramer, R.A., 1996. Tropical Forest Protection: An Empirical Analysis of the Costs Borne by Local People. *Journal of Environmental Economics and Management* 31, 129–144.
- Sills, E.O., Atmadja, S.S., de Sassi, C., Duchelle, A.E., Kweka, D.L., Resosudarmo, I.A.P., Sunderlin, W.D. (Eds.), 2014. REDD+ on the ground: A case book of subnational initiatives across the globe. Centre for International Forest Research (CIFOR), Bogor Barat.
- Smith, P., Martino, D., Cai, Z., Gwary, D., Janzen, H., Kumar, P., McCarl, B., Ogle, S., O'Mara, F., Rice, C., Scholes, B., Sirotenko, O., Howden, M., McAllister, T., Pan, G., Romanenkov, V., Schneider, U., Towprayoon, S., Wattenbach, M., Smith, J., 2008. Greenhouse gas mitigation in agriculture. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 363, 789–813. <https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2007.2184>
- Soares-Filho, B., Moutinho, P., Nepstad, D., Anderson, A., Rodrigues, H., Garcia, R., Dietzsch, L., Merry, F., Bowman, M., Hissa, L., Silvestrini, R., Maretti, C., 2010. Role of Brazilian Amazon protected areas in climate change mitigation. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 107, 10821–10826. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0913048107>
- Soares-Filho, B.S., Nepstad, D.C., Curran, L.M., Cerqueira, G.C., Garcia, R.A., Ramos, C.A., Voll, E., McDonald, A., Lefebvre, P., Schlesinger, P., 2006. Modelling

- conservation in the Amazon basin. *Nature* 440, 520–523.
<https://doi.org/10.1038/nature04389>
- Stickler, C. M., Coe, M. T., Costa, M. H., Nepstad, D. C., McGrath, D.G., Dias, L. C. P., Rodrigues, H. O., Soares-Filho, B. S., 2013. Dependence of hydropower energy generation on forests in the Amazon Basin at local and regional scales. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 110, 9601–9606.
<https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1215331110>
- Stickler, C. M., Nepstad, D.C., Azevedo, A.A., McGrath, D.G., 2013. Defending public interests in private lands: compliance, costs and potential environmental consequences of the Brazilian Forest Code in Mato Grosso. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 368, 20120160–20120160.
<https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2012.0160>
- Stickler, C.M., Nepstad, D.C., Coe, M.T., McGRATH, D.G., Rodrigues, H.O., Walker, W.S., Soares-Filho, B.S., Davidson, E.A., 2009. The potential ecological costs and cobenefits of REDD: a critical review and case study from the Amazon region. *Global Change Biology* 15, 2803–2824. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2009.02109.x>
- Sunderlin, W.D., Larson, A.M., Duchelle, A.E., Resosudarmo, I.A.P., Huynh, T.B., Awono, A., Dokken, T., 2014. How are REDD+ Proponents Addressing Tenure Problems? Evidence from Brazil, Cameroon, Tanzania, Indonesia, and Vietnam. *World Development* 55, 37–52. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2013.01.013>
- Tacconi, L., 2012. Redefining payments for environmental services. *Ecological Economics* 73, 29–36. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2011.09.028>
- Vera-Diaz, M. del C., Kaufmann, R.K., Nepstad, D.C., Schlesinger, P., 2008. An interdisciplinary model of soybean yield in the Amazon Basin: The climatic, edaphic, and economic determinants. *Ecological Economics* 65, 420–431.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2007.07.015>
- Walker, W., Baccini, A., Schwartzman, S., Ríos, S., Oliveira-Miranda, M.A., Augusto, C., Ruiz, M.R., Arrasco, C.S., Ricardo, B., Smith, R., Meyer, C., Jintach, J.C., Campos, E.V., 2014. Forest carbon in Amazonia: the unrecognized contribution of indigenous territories and protected natural areas. *Carbon Management* 5, 479–485.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/17583004.2014.990680>
- Walker, W.S., Stickler, C.M., Kellndorfer, J.M., Kirsch, K.M., Nepstad, D.C., 2010. Large-Area Classification and Mapping of Forest and Land Cover in the Brazilian Amazon: A Comparative Analysis of ALOS/PALSAR and Landsat Data Sources. *IEEE Journal of Selected Topics in Applied Earth Observations and Remote Sensing* 3, 594–604. <https://doi.org/10.1109/JSTARS.2010.2076398>
- Warren, M., Frohling, S., Dai, Z., Kurnianto, S., 2017. Impacts of land use, restoration, and climate change on tropical peat carbon stocks in the twenty-first century: implications for climate mitigation. *Mitigation and Adaptation Strategies for Global Change* 22, 1041–1061. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11027-016-9712-1>

- Zarin, D.J., Harris, N.L., Baccini, A., Aksenov, D., Hansen, M.C., Azevedo-Ramos, C., Azevedo, T., Margono, B.A., Alencar, A.C., Gabris, C., Allegretti, A., Potapov, P., Farina, M., Walker, W.S., Shevade, V.S., Loboda, T.V., Turubanova, S., Tyukavina, A., 2016. Can carbon emissions from tropical deforestation drop by 50% in 5 years? *Global Change Biology* 22, 1336–1347. <https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.13153>
- Ziegler, A.D., Phelps, J., Yuen, J.Q., Webb, E.L., Lawrence, D., Fox, J.M., Bruun, T.B., Leisz, S.J., Ryan, C.M., Dressler, W., Mertz, O., Pascual, U., Padoch, C., Koh, L.P., 2012. Carbon outcomes of major land-cover transitions in SE Asia: great uncertainties and REDD+ policy implications. *Global Change Biology* 18, 3087–3099. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2012.02747.x>