A Letter to the California Air Resources Board Regarding the Tropical Forest Standard

November 13, 2018

California Air Resources Board
1001 I Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

Dear CARB members and staff,

We are scientists—ecologists, economists, anthropologists, geographers, and climatologists. We are all directly involved with research to better understand climate change and to identify the best ways to avoid its most dangerous impacts. Many of us have spent decades working in the Tropics.

We are writing to strongly urge the California Air Resources Board to endorse the California Tropical Forest Standard (CTFS). We believe that California has a unique opportunity to leverage its global leadership on climate policy to advance a broad and inclusive agenda to address climate change by protecting tropical forests at scale.

The message we convey is this: slowing the loss and speeding the recovery of tropical forests is a critical part of any successful global strategy for minimizing the negative impacts of climate change. The CTFS is an important step towards unlocking this potential.

1. The best science shows us that tropical forests could help avoid the most dangerous impacts of climate change.\(^1\)\(^-\)\(^3\)

   These carbon- and species-rich ecosystems could deliver 25 to 30% of the carbon emissions reductions needed by 2030 to avoid dangerous climate change.\(^3\) Slowing the deforestation and degradation of tropical forests, the source of as much as one fifth of global emissions,\(^4\)\(^-\)\(^14\) while allowing damaged forests to recover\(^15\)\(^-\)\(^20\) is one of the most cost-effective, near-term steps towards a zero net carbon budget globally.\(^21\)\(^-\)\(^25\)

2. The CTFS could help unlock this potential.

   The CTFS would establish a very high bar of methodological rigor, transparency and accountability for tropical forest jurisdictions—states, provinces, counties and even nations—that are taking steps towards low-emission development. Given California’s global leadership on climate change solutions and the depth of the analyses and public consultation that went into developing the Standard, we believe that the CTFS would be adopted by other programs under development by governments and industries to support the transition of tropical forest jurisdictions to equitable low-emission development. The Standard is also likely to be used by tropical forest jurisdictions themselves.
3. The importance of the CTFS goes beyond offsets and REDD+

The CTFS was deliberately developed as an alternative to project-based REDD+ and it reflects a recognition that one of the most promising pathways to achieve emissions reductions at scale in tropical forest regions is to encourage the governments of jurisdictions to partner with civil society, the private sector, and indigenous peoples and local communities to develop durable programs for low emissions development. While the standard could eventually inform efforts to recognize the emissions reductions achieved by tropical forest jurisdictions in existing and emerging “pay-for-performance” programs, including implementation of California’s international offset provision, its value goes beyond this purpose.

The Standard is focused on jurisdictional26-28, or “sector-wide”, strategies for slowing the loss of tropical forests while improving the livelihoods and participation of forest communities within a broader transition to low-emission development. Jurisdictional strategies seek systemic solutions to deforestation, inadequate recognition of land rights, and other issues across entire political geographies—states and provinces—and are much less susceptible to leakage and dubious carbon accounting than some of the project-based examples that have been cited by others.

4. The CTFS already reflects important progress made in fostering stronger partnerships between tropical forest governments and indigenous peoples

One of the highlights of the Global Climate Action Summit in San Francisco last September was the announcement of “Guiding Principles for Collaboration and Partnership between Subnational Governments, Indigenous Peoples and Local Communities.” State and provincial governments that are members of the Governors’ Climate and Forests Task Force endorsed these principles and shook hands with the democratically-elected leaders of key Indigenous Peoples organizations in Indonesia (AMAN), Central America and Mexico (AMPB) and the Amazon (COICA). In all, 35 governments, 18 Indigenous Peoples organizations, and 17 environmental NGOs endorsed these principles, which have now been incorporated into the CTFS.

These partnerships are already happening, as has been documented for the State of Acre, in the Brazilian Amazon, which has a 20-year partnership between the state government and the Indigenous Peoples who reside in the state.28

Conclusion: To unlock the potential of tropical forests as a climate change solution, it is urgent that the California Tropical Forest Standard be endorsed. New governments in many tropical forest regions have just been elected and will define their major priorities in the next few months. If endorsement is postponed, an important opportunity will be lost to send the signal that California, in its role as a global leader of climate change
solutions, recognizes and supports bold efforts to address climate change by slowing the loss and speeding the recovery of tropical forests.

**********

Signatories as of November 13, 2018, alphabetical by last name:

[Total Number = 103; Members of the USA National Academy of Sciences = 8]

Dr. Ryan Abman, Economist, Assistant Professor, San Diego State University

Dr. Christa Anderson, Ecologist and California offsets expert, Stanford University

Kenneth Andrasko, President and CEO, AltaVerde Consulting (expert in climate change policy, forest carbon finance and low emissions development)

Dr. Ane Alencar, Amazon fire and indigenous territory monitoring, Researcher, Amazon Institute of Environmental Research (IPAM)

Dr. Arild Angelsen, Economist, REDD+ expert, Norwegian University of Life Sciences

Dr. Greg Asner, Forest Monitoring Expert, Ecologist, Staff Scientist, Carnegie Institute of Science (California)

Dr. Nigel Asquith, Watershed management, Director, Natura Bolivia Foundation

Dr. Alessandro Baccini, Remote Sensing Expert, Associate Scientist, Woods Hole Research Institute

Dr. Rizaldi Boer, Center for Climate Risk and Opportunity Management in Southeast Asia and Pacific, Bogor Agricultural University, Indonesia

Dr. Fred Boltz, Natural Resource Economist, CEO, Resolute Development Solutions.

Dr. William Boyd, Forest and Climate Governance and Law, Professor, UCLA Law School.

Dr. Paulo Brando, Ecologist and forest fire expert. Assistant Scientist, Woods Hole Research Center

Dr. I. Foster Brown, Environmental science and Amazon expert, Professor, Universidade Federal do Acre (Brazil)
Dr. Zuzana Burilova, Conservation Scientist specializing in tropical forests, Princeton University

Dr. Jonah Busch, Natural resource economics and tropical forest expert, Chief Economist, Earth Innovation Institute

Dr. Kimberly Carlson, Assistant Professor, Dept. of Natural Resources and Environmental Management, University of Hawaii

Dr. Roman Carrasco, Environmental Economist, Assistant Professor, National University of Singapore

Dr. Jill Caviglia-Harris, Professor of Economics, Economics and Finance Department, Environmental Studies Department, Salisbury University, Maryland

Dr. Jeff Chambers, Forest Ecosystem Ecologist, Professor of Geography, UC Berkeley

Dr. Ashwini Chhatre, Associate Professor of Public Policy, Indian School of Business

Dr. Robin Chazdon, Professor Emerita, Ecologist, University of Connecticut

Dr. James Clark, Statistical sciences, Professor, Duke University

Dr. Stefano Crema, Chief Application Research Officer, Clark Labs, Clark University

Dr. Lisa Curran, Ecologist and Indonesia expert, Professor, Stanford University

Dr. Gretchen C. Daily, Bing Professor of Environmental Science, Dept. of Biology and Woods Institute, Stanford University

Dr. Ruth DeFries, Sustainability Science, Columbia University and National Academy of Sciences

Dr. Bernardus de Jong, Tropical Forest Ecologist, El Colegio de la Frontera Sur, Mexico

Dr. Rodolfo Dirzo, Ecologist, Professor, Stanford University (Member, USA National Academy of Science)

Dr. Amy Duchelle, Ecologist and REDD+ expert, Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR)

Dr. Joana Durbin, Ecologist and REDD Safeguards Expert, Conservation International

Dr. Paul “Chip” Fay, Social Scientist and Asia Forest Expert, Fellow, Samdhana Institute

Dr. Philip Fearnside, Ecologist and Amazon Expert, Scientist, National Amazon Research Institute (INPA, Brazil)
Dr. Bruce Forsberg, Aquatic Ecologist and Amazon Expert, Researcher, National Amazon Research Institute (INPA, Brazil)

Dr. Chris Field, Director, Stanford Woods Institute for the Environment, Stanford University (National Academy of Science; IPCC Co-Chair and Lead Author)

Dr. Jason Funk, Associate Director for Land Use, Carbon180

Dr. David L.A. Gaveau, Associate, Center for International Forestry Research

Dr. Scott Goetz, Professor, School of Informatics, Computing and Cyber Systems, Northern Arizona University

Dr. Holly Gibbs, Professor, University of Wisconsin-Madison

Dr. Rose Goodman, Assist. Professor, Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences

Dr. Bronson Griscom, Director, Forest Carbon Science, The Nature Conservancy

Dr. Steven P. Hamburg, Forest Ecologist, Chief Scientist, Environmental Defense Fund

Dr. Susanna Hecht, Geographer, Professor, University of California, Los Angeles

Dr. Laura Hess, Associate Researcher, University of California, Santa Barbara

Dr. Ove Hoegh Guldberg, Professor, University of Queensland

Dr. Margaret Buck Holland, Associate Professor, Dept. of Geography and Environmental Systems, University of Maryland

Dr. Richard Houghton, Ecologist and Carbon Budget Expert, Senior Scientist, Woods Hole Research Center (IPCC Lead Author)

Dr. Silvia Irawan, Public Policy and REDD+ Finance Expert, Managing Director, Institut Penelitian Inovasi Bumi (INOBU), Indonesia

Dr. David Kaimowitz, former Director General, Center for International Forestry Research

Dr. Daniel Kammen, Professor of Energy, Energy and Resources Group, UC Berkeley

Dr. Claire Kremen, Professor, Dept. of Environmental Sciences Policy and Management, UC Berkeley

Dr. Torsten Krause, Associate Senior Lecturer, Lund University, Sweden

Dr. William Laurance, Ecologist, Tropical Forest Expert, Professor, James Cook University, Cairns, Australia
Dr. Beverly Law, Forest Ecologist, Oregon State University

Dr. Thomas Lovejoy, Ecologist, Amazon specialist, United Nations Foundation

Dr. Kathleen Lawlor, Assistant Professor of Economics, University of North Carolina Asheville

Dr. Ruben Lubowski, Chief Natural Resource Economist, Environmental Defense Fund

Dr. Colleen Scanlan Lyons, Anthropologist, Research Professor, University of Colorado

Dr. Marcia Macedo, Tropical Ecology and Land Use Specialist, Assistant Scientist, Woods Hole Research Center

Dr. Katharine Mach, Ecologist, Senior Research Scientist, Stanford University

Dr. Christopher Martius, Team Leader Climate Change, Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR)

Dr. David Marvin, Remote Sensing Expert & Tropical Ecologist, Co-Founder & CEO, Salo Sciences Inc., San Francisco, California

Dr. Bruce McCarl, University Distinguished Professor, Department of Agricultural Economics, Texas A&M University

Dr. David G. McGrath, Geographer and Amazon specialist, Senior Scientist, Earth Innovation Institute

Dr. Jeff Milder, Ecologist, Direct of Global Programs, Rainforest Alliance & Adjunct Professor, Cornell University

Dr. William R. Moomaw, Emeritus Professor, International Environmental Policy, The Fletcher School and Co-director Global Development and Environment institute, Tufts University

Dr. Harold Mooney, Ecologist, Professor Emeritus, Stanford University (Member National Academy of Science, USA)

Dr. Paulo Moutinho, Ecologist and Amazon Expert. Senior Scientist, Amazon Institute of Environmental Research (IPAM), Brazil

Dr. Katrina Mullan, Associate Professor of Economics, University of Montana

Dr. Rosamond Naylor, Economist and Food Systems Expert, Professor, Stanford University

Dr. Daniel Nepstad, Ecologist and Amazon specialist, President, Earth Innovation Institute (IPCC Lead Author)
Dr. Paulo Artaxo Neto, Atmospheric Chemist and Amazon specialist, Professor, Universidade de São Paulo, Brazil (IPCC Lead Author)

Dr. Peter Newton, Assistant Professor, Environmental Studies Program, University of Colorado

Dr. Michael Obersteiner, Ecosystem Modeler, Program Director, IIASA

Dr. Charles Palmer, Associate Professor of Environment & Development, Department of Geography & Environment, London School of Economics

Dr. Martin Persson, Associate Professor, Department of Energy & Environment, Chalmers University of Technology

Dr. Charles M. Peters, Ecologist and tropical forest management expert, Scientist (emeritus), New York Botanical Garden

Dr. Jacob Phelps, Lancaster Environment Centre, Lancaster University

Dr. Andrew Plantiga, Bren School of Environmental Science and Management, UC Santa Barbara

Dr. Catherine Potvin, Canada Research Chair on Climate Mitigation and Tropical Forests, McGill University

Dr. Francis Putz, Ecologist, Professor, University of Florida

Dr. Navin Ramankutty, Land system scientist, Professor, University of British Colombia

Dr. Peter Raven, President Emeritus, Missouri Botanical Garden

Dr. Daddy Ruhiyat. Tropical forest soil scientist, Professor, Mulawarman University, East Kalimantan, Indonesia

Dr. Tom Rudel, Distinguished Professor Emeritus, Rutgers University

Dr. Jeff Sayer, Professor of Tropical Forest Conservation, University of British Colombia

Dr. Stephen Schwartzman, Anthropologist, Amazon specialist, Environmental Defense Fund

Frances Seymour, Former Director General, Center for International Forestry Research

Dr. Priya Shyamsundar, Lead Economist, Global Science, The Nature Conservancy

Dr. Erin Sills, Department of Forestry and Environmental Resources, North Carolina State University
Dr. Thomas B. Smith, Ecologist, Professor of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, UCLA; Co-Executive Director, Congo Basin Institute; Director, Center for Tropical Research, Institute of the Environment and Sustainability, UCLA

Dr. Claudia Stickler, Tropical Land-Use Expert, Earth Innovation Institute

Dr. Charlotta Streck, International Climate Policy Expert, Director, Climate Focus

Dr. Brent Swallow, Resource Economist, Professor, University of Alberta

Dr. Luca Tacconi, Professor of Environmental Governance, Crawford School of Public Policy, The Australian National University

Dr. Will Turner, Climate Science and Forest Conservation expert, Senior Scientist, Conservation International

Dr. Reynaldo Victoria, Hydrologist, Amazon specialist, Universidade de São Paulo, Brazil (Emeritus)

Dr. Wayne Walker, Remote Sensing Expert, Associate Scientist, Woods Hole Research Center

Dr. Matthew Warren, Tropical Forest Ecologist, Research Associate, Earth Innovation Institute

Dr. John Watts, Anthropologist and Indonesia expert, Director of Research, Institut Penelitian Inovasi Bumi (INOBU), Indonesia

Dr. Edward Webb, California native, concerned citizen and environmental scientist. Associate Professor, Department of Biological Sciences, National University of Singapore

Dr. David S. Wilcove, Professor of Ecology, Evolutionary Biology and Public Affairs, Princeton University

Dr. Michael Wolosin, Ecologist and Tropical Deforestation Expert, Forest Climate Analytics

Dr. George Woodwell, Founder, Senior Scientist, Woods Hole Research Center

Dr. Sven Wunder, Natural Resource Economist, Principal Scientist, European Forest Institute

References Cited in the Letter


Sample of Other Relevant Publications by Signatory Scientists


forest landscapes. Environmental Research Letters 9, 074012. https://doi.org/10.1088/1748-9326/9/7/074012

Moutinho, P., Schwartzman, S. (Eds.), 2005. Tropical deforestation and climate change. Instituto de Pesquisa Ambiental da Amazônia ; Environmental Defense, Brasília, DF, Brasil : Washington, DC.


conservation in the Amazon basin. Nature 440, 520–523. https://doi.org/10.1038/nature04389


